

Feasibility Study

Lamoureux Pagano Associates (LPA) was contracted by the Westborough Board of Library Trustees, on behalf of the Town of Westborough, to assist in developing the Schematic Design and other requirements needed to submit a Construction Grant application to the Massachusetts Board of Library Commissioners (MBLC). The scope and process used by LPA is described in more detail in Part I.A Project Scope and Purpose, but consisted generally of documenting existing conditions, confirming needs and objectives, developing multiple design options and refining the preferred option to Schematic Design level.

Existing Conditions: The original Westborough Public Library was built in 1908 and includes the main building and a rear book stack wing. The book stack wing originally had two glass floor mezzanines with metal shelving and an overhead skylight; these features were at some point removed and a new floor constructed 7" above the main floor level. In 1980 the library was expanded to its current size of 20,000 Gross Square Feet (GSF) by an addition including public and staff program/support spaces, a new elevator, ramp, accessible Parkman Street entrance and other miscellaneous spaces.

Deficiencies are addressed in more detail in Part II of this report, but in general they include the following:

- Lack of on-site parking
- Lack of interior book drops
- Exterior envelope (original wood windows, lower level moisture infiltration, roofing/flashing systems, wood trim, masonry cracks)
- Interior finishes (paint, tile, wood floors, carpeting, ceilings, window treatments, etc.)
- Lack of fire suppression system
- Plumbing (outdated fixtures and equipment)
- HVAC (despite the recent 2012 work these include outdated equipment and controls)
- Electrical/Technology (inadequate Power/Data in public and staff areas, lack of emergency/stand-by power, outdated Lighting and Data/Technology infrastructure, lack of security and access control systems, etc.)
- Fixtures, Furnishings & Equipment (FF&E) including furniture, shelving, technology equipment/devices, collection security, etc.
- Lack of accessibility throughout the site and building

Also included in Part II – Assessment of Existing Conditions is an analysis of the Alternate Sites identified by the LBC for study.

Feasibility Study

Needs and Objectives: The proposed space needs for Westborough Public Library (WPL) are based on the 2011 Facility Review & Recommendations prepared by Kimberly Bolan Cullin. That document, which became part of the Library Building Program, identified a need for between about 7,500 – 16,000 additional GSF of new space (in addition to the current library’s 20,000 GSF), depending on whether the existing facility is replaced with new construction, or renovated and expanded. During the process of confirming needs and objectives, some minor adjustments were made to the Library Building Program which resulted in the amount of proposed additional space increasing slightly (to 16,357 GSF), based on the almost unanimous preference for an addition/renovation project. The need for more space is not limited to just one or two categories, but is distributed across virtually all public, staff, meeting and support areas (see existing vs. proposed graphic). However; the lack of Teen space, collaborative work areas and meeting rooms is particularly noteworthy.

A more significant Library Building Program adjustment was made when, later in the study, the Forbes Building renovations were approved. The Forbes Building plans include maintaining an existing 3,000 SF auditorium with capacity for over 150 occupants; this essentially duplicates the Large Meeting space in the Library Building Program. With the understanding that the adjacent Forbes space would be available for Town (and Library) use, LPA asked the Library Building Committee (LBC) and the MBLC if they would consider reducing the Library Building Program by omitting the Large Meeting Room. The answer was a conditional yes; MBLC responded that the Library’s Medium Meeting Room should have capacity to accommodate at least 55-60 occupants and the construction grant application should clearly describe the reason for omitting the large meeting space. The LBC has requested a letter from the Town stating that the Library, among other Town departments, will be allowed use of the Forbes Building meeting space. Factoring in the slightly larger Medium Meeting Room, this resulted in an overall reduction of over 3,000 GSF; a significant savings in terms of space and cost. All of the design options utilizing the existing site are based on the MBLC’s response allowing omission of the Large Meeting Room.

Design Options: LPA studied a range of options, from “no-build” to new construction on alternate sites. Multiple options were studied but can be distilled into these five basic categories:

1. Option 1 - Base Repair/Code Minimum: Correction of code violations, repair of building systems that are broken, code-mandated improvements, etc.
2. Option 2 - Addition/Renovation: Maintains nearly all of existing building and adds a new floor level above the existing 1980 addition.
3. Options 3A and 3B - Demolition/Renovation/Addition: Retains only the main (front) portion of original 1908 building; book stack wing and all of 1980 addition are demolished. Separate three and four story options were studied in this category.
4. Option 4 - Demolition/Renovation/Addition on Expanded Lot: Same as previous category except Parkman Street is proposed to become one-way (for Police/Fire use only) in order to provide more buildable space.

Feasibility Study

5. Options 5A and 5B - New Construction on Alternate Site: Two alternate sites (the State Hospital and Senior Center) were studied. MBLC requires that at least one alternate site be studied for new construction; even when there is an initial preference to reuse the existing building.

Each Design Option is described in greater detail; in Part IV Options and Recommendations, by graphic site/floor plans and a summary page including GSF total area, Building Program compliance and comparative merits/limitations. After LPA's presentation, the LBC and Board Library Trustees voted to support Option 3A – Demolition/Addition/Renovation as the preferred option for further refinement. Options 1 and 2 do not fully meet Building Program requirements and are therefore presumed to be ineligible for an MBLC Construction Grant; the Town would bear the full cost of the project without any state funding assistance. The other grant-eligible Options (3B, 4, 5A and 5B) were rejected because of their significant limitations as well as the Owner's preference to maintain use of the existing library.

Preferred Option: Option 3A was refined to Schematic Design level, resulting in several design revisions including the following:

- Adult Library, Teen Room and Medium Meeting Room were relocated from the upper to the lower level.
- Digital Media Lab, Small Meeting Room and Staff Lounge were relocated from the upper to the main level.
- Children's Library was relocated from the lower to the upper level.
- Westborough Room (Local History) was relocated from the main to the upper level.

Schematic Design level documents including site/floor plans, elevations, sections, demolition plans, basis of design narratives and outline specifications can be found in Part V Preferred Option. These documents formed the basis for the independent Construction Cost estimate (also found in Part V). It should be noted that the Construction Cost estimate is only one component of the Total Project Budget (TPB), a copy of which is also included in Part V – Preferred Option. The Total Project Budget represents **all** project costs including Designer/OPM fees, legal fees, utility backcharges, temporary library costs, Fixtures/Furnishings/& Equipment (FF&E), Technology, construction testing, printing, Owner's contingency, building systems commissioning, advertising, filing fees, and other miscellaneous project costs.

Part V – Preferred Option also includes presentation graphics (3D exterior/interior renderings, site/floor plans, timeline, etc.) for the MBLC Construction Grant application and community outreach purposes.